

JUDGING FORM (10-minute presentation)
International Business Ethics and Sustainability Case Competition
Loyola Marymount University

<u>SESSION</u> (Date and Time)	<u>TOPIC</u>	<u>TEAM</u> (School and Division)

Judge Information

If you have a business card, please leave with Senior Judge

Name _____

Organization _____

Email _____

General Instructions – 10-Minute Presentation

This presentation focuses solely on the ethical issues and is given by two or three members of the team. Teams imagine that this presentation is the result of being called back after their full presentation in order to give a shorter presentation strictly about the ethical issues of their topic. There is no power point presentation, handouts or Q&A. Teams are expected to have incorporated feedback received from the full presentation into this 10-minute presentation.

Ethical Dimension

Please base your score on how well the team answered the following questions:

- From an ethical and values-based perspective, why is the problem an ethical issue?
- What is the amount and type of tangible good and harm involved in the problem and in the solution?
- Are the actions themselves in this case (in the problem and solution) ethically defensible?
- What positive ethical value does the solution advance?
- Is the solution ethically acceptable?

Scoring – How well did the team present the ethical issues in a straightforward way, relating them directly to central issues associated with running the organization? (The discussion of the ethical issues should have helped the team “sell” the team’s solution to the executives.) Check boxes below.

(1) Outstanding	(2) Good	(3) Acceptable	(4) Marginal	(5) Weak
Complicated ethical issues made easy to understand. Relevance to business concerns was clear and insightful.	Ethical issues explained simply. Connection to business concerns was clear.	Explanation needed development, but you got the general idea of the ethical issues and connection to the business concern.	You only partially understood the ethical issue (explanation not clear or too technical) and/or the connection to the business concern.	Explanation seriously incomplete. You barely understood the ethical issues.

Did the team use technical philosophical language, cite philosophers as authorities or appeal to any religious tradition? (Not appropriate in typical business setting.)

Yes No

Persuasiveness

Please base your score on the following:

- Was the ethical problem clearly explained?
- Was the argument clear and well thought out?
- Is the solution responsible and compelling?

Scoring – Were you convinced by the team’s argument and suggested solution? Check boxes below.

<p>(1) Outstanding Convinced and I would act on their recommendations. You have no reservations.</p>	<p>(2) Good Convinced. You have some reservations, but nothing major.</p>	<p>(3) Acceptable More or less convinced. You have some reservations, but the presentation left you more convinced than unconvinced.</p>	<p>(4) Marginal Almost convinced. You have major reservations that leave you unconvinced, and found more than 50% of the presentation unconvincing.</p>	<p>(5) Weak Unconvinced. The presentation may have some good points, but clearly not enough to convince you.</p>

Presentation Skills

Please base your score on the following:

- Were the speakers comfortable enough with the material that they did not read from a script?
- Could all the speakers be heard?
- Did the speakers manage the time well?
- Was the team polished and professional?

Scoring – Was the presentation convincing?

(1) Outstanding Everything one could expect, plus more	(2) Good Everything one could reasonably expect	(3) Acceptable Most of what one could reasonably expect	(4) Marginal Much of what should be there, but not enough	(5) Weak Some of what should be there, but seriously incomplete

General comments, if any: